

Collaborative Governance of Jember Customs in Combating the Distribution of Illegal Cigarettes

Muh. Ali Imron^{1*}, Edy Wahyudi², Suyani Indriastuti³

^{1,2,3} Master's Program in Administrative Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Jember, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author: muhammadaliimron17@gmail.com

Article History

Received: 05-06-2026

Revised: 17-06-2026

Published: 30-06-2026

Keywords: Collaborative Governance, Illegal Cigarettes, Customs Administration; Public Policy, Inter-Agency Coordination

ABSTRACT

The circulation of illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency has become a complex public policy issue due to the region's strategic position as a tobacco-producing area and the increasing distribution of untaxed cigarettes that cause state revenue losses and unhealthy business competition. Previous studies have predominantly emphasized legal enforcement and taxation aspects, while limited research has examined collaborative governance involving multiple stakeholders in combating illegal cigarette distribution at the local level. This study aims to analyze the implementation of collaborative governance by Jember Customs in combating the distribution of illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency. This research employed a qualitative descriptive method with data collected through interviews, observations, and documentation involving Customs officers, local government, Satpol PP, law enforcement agencies, business actors, and community representatives. Data analysis was conducted through data reduction, presentation, and conclusion drawing. The results indicate that collaborative governance has been implemented through joint operations, public socialization, supervision, and inter-agency coordination supported by the Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Fund (DBHCHT). However, challenges remain in limited human resources, broad supervisory areas, and low public awareness. This study concludes that collaborative governance strengthens inter-agency synergy and improves the effectiveness of illegal cigarette control in Jember Regency.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is recognized as one of the countries with the largest number of smokers in the world, ranking third after China and India. Based on the Global Adult Tobacco Survey (GATS) in 2011, the smoking prevalence in Indonesia reached 36.1% (Rosdianti, 2021). Over time, the number of smokers has continued to increase, with more than 60 million smokers recorded in 2013 (Suryadinata, 2023). Recent data in 2021 showed that 28.96% of Indonesia's population were smokers, the majority of whom were men (Agustina & Wijaya, 2022).

Smoking behavior has also become widespread among adolescents, with youth smoking prevalence reaching 38% (Simon, 2023). These conditions indicate the significant challenges faced by the Indonesian government in controlling tobacco consumption within society.

The high number of smokers in Indonesia is directly proportional to its position as one of the world's largest tobacco-producing countries. More than 1,132 cigarette factories operate in Indonesia, making it the country with the highest number of cigarette manufacturers globally (Sulastri et al., 2018). Cigarette production reached 270 billion sticks in 2011 dominated by kretek cigarettes, which remain the primary preference of local consumers (Handayani, 2023; Rosdianti, 2021). The Indonesian tobacco industry is highly competitive due to the dominance of domestic producers manufacturing kretek cigarettes on a large scale (Hurt et al., 2011).

At the global level, the World Health Organization Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (WHO FCTC) represents a significant international agreement in combating the tobacco epidemic, which is recognized as one of the leading causes of preventable morbidity and mortality worldwide. Established in 2003 and enforced in 2005, the FCTC became the first international public health treaty aimed at reducing tobacco consumption and its health impacts. By 2023, the FCTC had been ratified by 181 countries, demonstrating broad global commitment toward tobacco control measures. The treaty includes various strategies and obligations for member states, including the implementation of the MPOWER package consisting of monitoring tobacco use, protecting people from tobacco smoke, offering help to quit smoking, warning about the dangers of tobacco, enforcing bans on tobacco advertising and promotion, and increasing tobacco taxes (Levy et al., 2020; Stone, 2017).

However, until 2024 Indonesia remained one of the few countries that had not ratified the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC), despite actively participating in international discussions on tobacco control since the late 1990s (Pambudi, 2021; Subagyo & Primawanti, 2022). The reluctance of the Indonesian government to ratify the FCTC is strongly influenced by concerns regarding the economic impact on the domestic tobacco industry, which plays an important role in employment and state revenue generation (Ahsan, Afri, et al., 2022; Moeis et al., 2022). Indonesia faces a complex dilemma between strengthening tobacco control policies for public health and maintaining economic dependence on the cigarette industry (Moeis et al., 2022; Ravie, 2023). In addition, overlapping institutional authority and the absence of an integrated tobacco control framework have become significant obstacles to implementing effective tobacco control policies (Kramer et al., 2023; Moeis et al., 2022). Although several local governments have attempted to implement smoke-free policies, such policies are often inconsistent and lack effective enforcement mechanisms (Astuti et al., 2020; Yunarman et al., 2021).

This problem is further exacerbated by the widespread circulation of illegal cigarettes, which not only harms public health but also reduces state revenue from excise taxes. Based on data from the Directorate General of Customs and Excise in December 2023, approximately

36.26 billion cigarette sticks circulated in the market, while millions of illegal cigarettes were confiscated through courier and delivery services. Illegal cigarettes generally circulate without excise stamps, use counterfeit excise stamps, or use inappropriate excise labels (Permana & Sanusi, 2021). Such illegal products create unfair market competition and potentially endanger consumers because their contents are not laboratory tested.

In the supervisory area of Jember Customs, the circulation of illegal cigarettes remains highly prevalent. In 2023, Jember Customs confiscated approximately 1,788,200 illegal cigarette sticks and 350 grams of sliced tobacco, causing estimated state losses of IDR 1.2 billion through 274 enforcement actions. In 2024, approximately 2,035,440 illegal cigarette sticks, including Machine-Made Kretek Cigarettes (SKM) and Hand-Rolled Kretek Cigarettes (SKT), were secured. Meanwhile, in 2025, enforcement data showed a significant decline, with 872,676 illegal cigarette sticks confiscated until September 2025. Enforcement operations targeted both transportation facilities and retail distribution points throughout Jember Regency. These conditions indicate that combating illegal cigarette distribution requires cooperation and participation from various stakeholders, including government institutions and society.

One approach considered relevant to addressing this issue is collaborative governance. Collaborative governance refers to collaborative public management that emphasizes cooperation among governmental institutions through decentralized mechanisms while remaining within the national regulatory framework. Previous studies in Malang City and Malang Regency demonstrated that the division of roles between central and local governments increased the effectiveness of illegal cigarette enforcement. In the context of this study, the success of combating illegal cigarettes refers to the effectiveness of enforcement and coordination carried out by Jember Customs (Raihan Budiman et al., 2024).

The implementation of collaborative governance in Jember involves various activities, including public socialization and education, market operations, supervision, and direct enforcement against illegal cigarette distribution. These activities are supported by the Regulation of the Minister of Finance of the Republic of Indonesia Number 7/PMK.07/2020 concerning the utilization, monitoring, and evaluation of the Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Fund (DBHCHT). Through inter-agency collaboration involving Jember Customs, local governments, Satpol PP, law enforcement agencies, business actors, and communities, it is expected that the circulation of illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency can be effectively reduced.

Based on the background above, this study aims to analyze the implementation of collaborative governance by Jember Customs in combating the distribution of illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency. This study is expected to contribute theoretically to the development of public administration studies, particularly collaborative governance and excise policy enforcement, while practically providing recommendations for improving collaborative efforts in controlling illegal cigarette circulation.

METHOD

This study employed a qualitative approach using a case study design to analyze the implementation of collaborative governance by the Jember Customs Office in combating illegal cigarette circulation in Jember Regency. The qualitative method was selected because it enables an in-depth understanding of social phenomena and interactions among stakeholders involved in collaborative governance. Jember Regency was chosen as the research location because it is one of the major tobacco-producing regions in East Java with numerous cigarette industries, while the circulation of illegal cigarettes remains widespread in the community.

The research focused on collaborative governance practices implemented by the Jember Customs Office in cooperation with local governments, law enforcement agencies, business actors, and the community. The study used both primary and secondary data. Primary data were obtained through interviews and field observations, while secondary data were collected from official reports, regulations, journals, and related documentation. Informants were selected using purposive sampling techniques and included officials from the Enforcement and Investigation Division (P2) of Jember Customs, Internal Compliance officers, Satpol PP members, cigarette business actors, community leaders, and local residents.

Data collection techniques consisted of in-depth interviews, non-participant observation, and documentation. Semi-structured interviews were conducted to explore the perspectives and experiences of informants regarding collaborative governance implementation. The collected data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles and Huberman, (2023), which includes data collection, data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing or verification. To ensure data validity and credibility, this study applied source triangulation and method triangulation by comparing information from different informants and data collection techniques.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Result

This section presents the findings of the study regarding the implementation of collaborative governance in combating illegal cigarette circulation in Jember Regency.

1. The Condition of Illegal Cigarette Circulation in Jember Regency

Jember Regency is one of the strategic tobacco-producing regions and cigarette industry centers in East Java, where many cigarette factories operate from small-scale to large-scale industries. The high level of production and trade activities in tobacco products contributes significantly to employment opportunities and state revenue from the excise sector. However, this condition has also led to the widespread circulation of illegal cigarettes within the community. Illegal cigarettes are generally distributed without excise stamps, using counterfeit excise stamps, or using excise stamps that do not comply with regulations. This phenomenon indicates that the high activity of the cigarette industry has not been fully

among local governments, law enforcement agencies, business actors, and the community. Such collaboration is important to strengthen supervision, increase public awareness regarding the dangers of illegal cigarettes, and create synergy in maintaining state revenue and healthy business competition within the tobacco industry sector.

2. The Importance of Collaborative Governance in Combating Illegal Cigarettes

The problem of illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency is a complex issue that cannot be resolved solely by the Jember Customs Office as the primary excise supervisory institution. The wide supervision area, limited human resources in the field, and various illegal cigarette distribution methods highlight the importance of involving other actors. Therefore, the collaborative governance approach becomes relevant because it emphasizes cooperation among government institutions, law enforcement agencies, the community, and business actors in achieving common objectives. Regarding this matter, the Head of the Regional Legal Enforcement Division (PPDH) of Satpol PP stated:

“I believe the cooperation with the local government has existed for a long time. However, Satpol PP only began handling it in 2022 after the responsibility was transferred from the Economic Division. Previously, the secretariat was under the Regional Development Planning Agency (Bappeda), but now it is directly managed by the Satpol PP secretariat. Therefore, even in terms of coordination patterns, from what I observe in the administrative correspondence, the implementation is now more direct through the Satpol PP secretariat.”

Collaborative governance emphasizes inter-agency cooperation through mechanisms that remain within the framework of national regulations. Through this model, each party performs roles according to its respective capacity. Customs officers are responsible for supervision and enforcement, local governments provide policy and budgetary support, law enforcement agencies assist field operations, and the community functions as social supervisors. Such synergy is expected to strengthen the effectiveness of combating illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency.

3. Forms of Collaborative Governance Implementation in Jember

The implementation of collaborative governance in combating illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency is realized through various joint activities among actors. These activities include public socialization regarding the characteristics of illegal cigarettes, education on the dangers of consuming illegal cigarettes, market operations, and direct enforcement against distribution channels and retail sellers. These activities are conducted in an integrated manner involving the Jember Customs Office, the local government through Satpol PP, and community elements.

Furthermore, the collaboration is supported by the utilization of the Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Fund (DBHCHT) as regulated in the Minister of Finance Regulation Number 7/PMK.07/2020. The fund is used to support supervision activities, public socialization, and law enforcement. With policy support, clear role distribution, and commitment among actors, collaborative governance is expected to create better excise

governance and sustainably reduce the circulation of illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency. Regarding this matter, Customs Investigator Mr. Hendy emphasized:

“The funding sourced from the Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Fund (DBHCHT) is initiated by the local government, particularly Satpol PP. The operation is carried out in the form of a team involving the Prosecutor’s Office, Police Department, Military District Command, and Military Police. However, the field executor responsible for securing the confiscated goods remains the Jember Customs Office because we have the legal authority under the law.”

The interview findings indicate that the implementation of collaborative governance in combating illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency utilizes the Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Fund (DBHCHT). The local government through Satpol PP acts as the initiator of activities by utilizing DBHCHT funds to support operations against illegal cigarette circulation.

4. Actors and Roles in Collaborative Governance

4.1 Jember Customs Office as the Leading Sector

In the collaborative governance framework for combating illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency, the Jember Customs Office occupies the position of the leading sector with formal authority in excise supervision and law enforcement. The Customs Office plays a role in designing supervision strategies, conducting enforcement operations, and coordinating cooperation with various related parties. As a vertical institution under the Directorate General of Customs and Excise, it serves as the central driving force in efforts to suppress the circulation of illegal cigarettes within its supervisory area.

Besides enforcement functions, the Jember Customs Office also carries out educational roles through public socialization regarding the characteristics of illegal cigarettes, the impact of state revenue losses, and the importance of compliance with excise regulations. This role is important because combating illegal cigarettes does not solely rely on legal repression but also requires increasing public awareness so that people do not purchase or distribute illegal cigarettes. Regarding this matter, Customs Investigator Mr. Hendy stated:

“Besides us (Jember Customs Office), there are also the Prosecutor’s Office, Police Department, Military District Command, Military Police, and Satpol PP. Several other agencies are also involved. It is formed as a team, but the field executor responsible for securing the confiscated goods remains us (Jember Customs Office) because we have the legal authority and jurisdiction.”

Based on these findings, it can be analyzed that the Directorate General of Customs and Excise through the Jember Customs Office holds a central position in implementing collaborative governance for combating illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency. The role as the leading sector is reflected through its formal authority in supervision, enforcement, and investigation of excise violations.



Figure 2. Joint Assembly for Illegal Cigarette Enforcement Operations with Regional Law Enforcement Agencies and Socialization on Illegal Cigarette Eradication with the Jember Local Government

Figure 2 illustrates the collaborative activities carried out by the Jember Customs Office together with regional law enforcement agencies and the Jember Local Government before conducting joint enforcement operations against illegal cigarettes. The assembly activity demonstrates coordination and synergy among institutions involved in combating illegal cigarette circulation. In addition, the socialization activities conducted jointly with the local government reflect preventive efforts aimed at increasing public awareness regarding the dangers and legal consequences of illegal cigarette distribution. These activities indicate that collaborative governance is implemented not only through law enforcement operations but also through educational and preventive approaches involving multiple stakeholders.

Besides carrying out repressive functions through enforcement operations, the Jember Customs Office also performs preventive and educational functions for the community. Socialization regarding the characteristics of illegal cigarettes, the impact of state losses, and the importance of compliance with excise regulations demonstrates that combating illegal cigarettes is not solely oriented toward law enforcement but also toward building public awareness.

4.2. The Role of Local Government and Law Enforcement Agencies

The Jember Local Government plays a strategic role in supporting collaborative governance through regional policies, coordination mechanisms, and the utilization of Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Funds (DBHCHT) for socialization, supervision, and enforcement activities against illegal cigarettes. Coordination among institutions is administratively managed through the local government and Satpol PP as part of the DBHCHT secretariat system. In addition, law enforcement agencies such as Satpol PP support operational activities in the field, particularly in territorial supervision and monitoring retail sales points. Satpol PP officers at the sub-district level also assist in detecting illegal cigarette circulation through coordination with village authorities and local communities. The findings indicate that the synergy between the Jember Customs Office, local government, and law enforcement agencies strengthens area-based supervision and improves the effectiveness of illegal cigarette detection and enforcement in Jember Regency.

4.3. Communities and Business Actors as Collaborative Partners

Communities and business actors also contribute significantly to collaborative governance implementation. Delivery service providers and legal cigarette companies participate by complying with excise regulations and monitoring suspicious cigarette distribution activities. Communities additionally function as social supervisors who provide information regarding illegal cigarette circulation within local areas.

“If the package does not have an excise stamp, we cannot continue the delivery process because it violates operational procedures” (The Head of the Delivery Point (DP) of a shipping service company in Jember).

The findings reveal that public participation and private sector compliance contribute positively to strengthening supervision and reducing illegal cigarette circulation in Jember Regency.

Discussion

The findings of this study demonstrate that collaborative governance has become an important approach in combating illegal cigarette circulation in Jember Regency. The complexity of illegal cigarette distribution, which involves extensive distribution networks, economic interests, and weak public compliance, cannot be handled solely by the Jember Customs Office. Therefore, the involvement of multiple stakeholders such as local government institutions, Satpol PP, law enforcement agencies, business actors, and the community is essential to strengthen supervision and law enforcement. This finding is consistent with previous studies emphasizing that illicit cigarette eradication requires cross-sector collaboration because illegal trade is generally organized, adaptive, and difficult to control through single-agency enforcement alone (Bina et al., 2026; Sonatha Sinaga et al., 2025).

The results also indicate that the Jember Customs Office acts as the leading sector within the collaborative governance framework. Its authority in supervision, enforcement, and investigation positions Customs as the central actor coordinating other institutions involved in joint operations. This condition reflects the collaborative governance where public institutions function as facilitators and coordinators in solving complex public problems through inter-organizational cooperation (Ansell & Gash, 2018; Costumato, 2021). The operational synergy between Customs, Satpol PP, regional law enforcement agencies, and local governments found in this study strengthens the argument that collaborative governance is more effective when each institution performs roles according to its formal authority and institutional capacity (Hasmita et al., 2025).

Another important finding concerns the role of the Jember Local Government through the utilization of Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Funds (DBHCHT). The study found that DBHCHT supports socialization activities, market operations, supervision, and enforcement programs against illegal cigarettes. This result aligns with recent studies explaining that DBHCHT has become a strategic policy instrument in supporting tobacco control and excise

governance at the regional level. The allocation of excise-sharing funds not only strengthens enforcement capacity but also encourages institutional coordination and community involvement in maintaining state revenue from the excise sector (Ahsan et al., 2024; Rianto et al., 2025).

The involvement of Satpol PP and regional law enforcement agencies also demonstrates that local-based supervision is important in detecting illegal cigarette circulation, especially in rural areas and small retail stores. Satpol PP officers at the sub-district level possess better knowledge of local social conditions and community networks, enabling them to function as providers of initial field information. This finding confirms that collaborative governance is strengthened when local actors who understand community dynamics are actively involved in monitoring and enforcement processes. Previous studies on illegal cigarette eradication in Indonesia similarly found that regional coordination and territorial supervision improve the effectiveness of field operations and information gathering (Sonatha Sinaga et al., 2025).

Furthermore, this study reveals that public participation remains a crucial supporting factor in combating illegal cigarettes. Community awareness to avoid purchasing illegal cigarettes and willingness to report illegal distribution activities contribute significantly to strengthening social supervision. The participation of religious leaders and Islamic boarding school communities in supporting government policies also provides moral legitimacy for anti-illegal cigarette campaigns. This finding is consistent with the collaborative governance perspective proposed by Ansell & Gash (2018) and supported by Ahsan et al., (2022), which emphasizes that effective and sustainable policy implementation requires coordination, stakeholder trust, shared commitment, and active participation among government and non-government actors

Furthermore collaborative governance challenges in controlling illegal cigarettes in Jember Regency, including broad surveillance coverage, limited human resources, and evolving illegal distribution practices, remain major obstacles to effective monitoring and law enforcement. These findings are consistent with previous studies showing that extensive territorial coverage and weak supervisory capacity can contribute to the widespread circulation of illicit cigarettes in various regions and countries (Arda & Santiago, 2023; Aziz & Aziz, 2024). In Madura, for example, high cigarette excise rates were associated with the increasing circulation of illegal cigarettes without excise stamps, thereby complicating enforcement efforts across broad areas (Aziz & Aziz, 2024). Similarly, studies conducted in the Philippines highlighted that fragmented policy implementation, limited law enforcement cooperation, and weak regulatory structures contribute to the persistence of illicit tobacco trade (2). Limited personnel, facilities, and institutional coordination also reduce the effectiveness of tobacco excise control policies in practice, particularly in areas with low enforcement capacity (Arda & Santiago, 2023). Furthermore, illicit cigarette distribution networks may adapt to enforcement measures, causing conventional monitoring approaches to become less effective over time (Aziz & Aziz, 2024). This condition may undermine the

fiscal and public health objectives of tobacco excise policies, including increasing state revenue and reducing illicit cigarette consumption (Ardana et al., 2025; Lavares et al., 2022). Therefore, strengthening collaborative governance through improved inter-agency coordination, enhanced human resource capacity, and the implementation of technologies such as track and trace systems is essential to support more effective and real-time monitoring of cigarette distribution (Arda & Santiago, 2023; Borkowski & Fibbi, 2025).

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that collaborative governance is a relevant approach in combating illegal cigarette circulation in Jember Regency. The findings show that the complexity of illegal cigarette distribution, limited human resources, and wide supervision areas require collaboration among the Jember Customs Office, local government, Satpol PP, law enforcement agencies, business actors, and the community. The Jember Customs Office acts as the leading sector in supervision, enforcement, investigation, and public education regarding illegal cigarettes. Collaborative governance is implemented through integrated activities such as socialization programs, market operations, field supervision, and direct enforcement actions. In addition, the utilization of Tobacco Excise Revenue Sharing Funds (DBHCHT) supports supervision and enforcement activities. The synergy among stakeholders has strengthened supervision effectiveness and improved excise governance in Jember Regency, although illegal cigarette circulation remains an ongoing challenge that requires sustainable collaborative efforts.

Conceptually, this study contributes to the development of collaborative governance theory in the context of public policy implementation and excise law enforcement in Indonesia. The findings demonstrate that collaborative governance is not only administrative cooperation among institutions, but also a strategic mechanism to build collective responsibility in addressing complex public issues. Through coordination, communication, and shared commitment among stakeholders, collaborative governance strengthens policy implementation and public participation. Methodologically, this study applies a qualitative descriptive approach through interviews, observations, and documentation to examine collaboration patterns among actors involved in combating illegal cigarettes. The study also highlights the importance of local government support, community participation, and institutional commitment in strengthening sustainable policy implementation.

Despite these contributions, this study still has several limitations. First, the study only focuses on collaborative governance implementation in Jember Regency, which limits the generalization of findings to other regions with different social and institutional characteristics. Second, the study mainly relies on qualitative data obtained from interviews and observations, so it does not quantitatively measure the effectiveness of collaborative governance in reducing illegal cigarette circulation. Therefore, future studies are recommended to apply mixed-method approaches and conduct comparative studies in

different regions to obtain broader and more comprehensive findings regarding collaborative governance in combating illegal cigarettes.

REFERENCES

- Agustina, E. P., & Wijaya, S. (2022). Literature Review: Analysis of the Implementation of Smoke-Free Area (SFA) Policies in Health Service Facilities. *Journal of Social and Science*, 2(8), 921–939. <https://doi.org/10.59188/jurnalsosains.v2i8.454>
- Ahsan, A., Afin, R., Amalia, N., Hindriyani, M., Jacinda, A. R., & Kramer, E. (2022). FCTC ratification, smoking prevalence, and GDP per capita: Lessons for Indonesia and the rest of the world. *Globalization and Health*, 18(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12992-022-00810-y>
- Ahsan, A., Bahjuri Ali, P., Puji Rahmayanti, K., Glorya Montesori Siahaan, R., Amalia, N., & Author, C. (2022). Mitigation Task Force for Farmers and Workers in Indonesia: A Collaborative Governance Approach in Tobacco Control. *Jurnal Perencanaan Pembangunan: The Indonesian Journal of Development Planning*, 6(3), 327–349. <https://doi.org/10.36574/JPP.V6I3.287>
- Ahsan, A., Wiyono, N. H., Amalia, N., Rusdjijati, R., Veruswati, M., Martini, S., Prabandari, Y. S., & Yuniar, A. M. (2024). Early assessment of the tobacco excise revenue-sharing fund as a policy for farmers' viable alternatives in Indonesia: A case study of four municipalities in Indonesia. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 11(1), 89. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-023-02585-y>
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2018). Collaborative Platforms as a Governance Strategy. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 28(1), 16–32. <https://doi.org/10.1093/JOPART/MUX030>
- Arda, J. R. Y., & Santiago, A. J. A. (2023). Strengthening Policies and Structures to Combat Illicit Tobacco Trade in the Philippines. *Frontiers in Public Health*, 11, 1089853. <https://doi.org/10.3389/FPUBH.2023.1089853/TEXT>
- Ardana, B. Y., Ananda, C. F., & Bintoro, N. S. (2025). Enforcement of Illicit Cigarettes Increases Excise Revenue in Indonesia. *World Customs Journal*, 19(2), 68–81. <https://doi.org/10.55596/001C.144234>
- Astuti, P. A. S., Assunta, M., & Freeman, B. (2020). Why Is Tobacco Control Progress in Indonesia Stalled? A Qualitative Analysis of Interviews with Tobacco Control Experts. *BMC Public Health*, 20(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-020-08640-6>
- Aziz, W., & Aziz, W. (2024). Legal Issues in the Implementation of Excise Tariffs on Cigarette Companies in Madura. *Trunojoyo Law Review*, 6(1), 120–141. <https://doi.org/10.21107/tlr.v6i1.23227>
- Borkowski, F., & Fibbi, E. (2025). How Can Tracking and Tracing Systems Give Us a Look at the Dark Side of the Tobacco Market? *Tobacco Control*, 34(3), 309–314. <https://doi.org/10.1136/TC-2023-058212>
- Costumato, L. (2021). Collaboration Among Public Organizations: A Systematic Literature Review on Determinants of Interinstitutional Performance. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 34(3), 247–273. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPSM-03-2020-0069>

- Handayani, L. (2023). Smoking Habits Among Adults in Indonesia: Findings from the 2021 Global Adult Tobacco Survey (GATS). *JWINS*, 3(4). <https://doi.org/10.37887/jwins.v3i4.35326>
- Hasmita, W., Arifin, M. A., Yusran, M., Darmawansyah, D., Jafar, N., & Hariani, H. (2025). Collaborative Governance in Combating Illegal Cosmetics: A Study of Multi-Stakeholder Dynamics in South Sulawesi, Indonesia. *Journal of Angiotherapy*, 9(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.25163/ANGIOTHERAPY.9110158>
- Huberman, M., & Miles, M. B. (2023). Qualitative Data Analysis. In *Research and Evaluation for Busy Students and Practitioners* (pp. 187–202). <https://doi.org/10.51952/9781447366263.ch012>
- Hurt, R. D., Ebbert, J. O., Achadi, A., & Croghan, I. T. (2011). Roadmap to a Tobacco Epidemic: Transnational Tobacco Companies Invade Indonesia. *Tobacco Control*, 21(3), 306–312. <https://doi.org/10.1136/tc.2010.036814>
- Kramer, E., Ahsan, A., & Rees, V. W. (2023). Policy Incoherence and Tobacco Control in Indonesia: An Analysis of the National Tobacco-Related Policy Mix. *Tobacco Control*, 32(4), 410–417. <https://doi.org/10.1136/tobaccocontrol-2021-056633>
- Laksono, B. S., Wulandari, S., & Suhindarno, H. (2026). Collaborative Synergy Between Customs and Government in the Program to Combat Illegal Cigarettes. *Publik: Journal of Human Resource Management, Administration and Public Services*, 13(1), 367–384. <https://doi.org/10.37606/PUBLIK.V13I1.2211>
- Lavares, M. P., Ross, H., Francisco, A., & Doytch, N. (2022). Analysing the Trend of Illicit Tobacco in the Philippines from 1998 to 2018. *Tobacco Control*, 31(6), 701–706. <https://doi.org/10.1136/TOBACCOCONTROL-2020-056253>
- Levy, D. T., Li, Y., & Yuan, Z. (2020). Impact of Nations Meeting the MPOWER Targets Between 2014 and 2016: An Update. *Tobacco Control*, 29(2), 231–233. <https://doi.org/10.1136/TOBACCOCONTROL-2018-054837>
- Moeis, F. R., Nurhasana, R., Rahardi, F., Novitasari, D., Shellasih, N. M., Inayati, Murwendah, Suriyawongpaisal, P., Patanavanich, R., & Ratih, S. P. (2022). The Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) and the Implementation of Tobacco Control Policies: Lessons Learned from Indonesia and Thailand. *World Medical & Health Policy*, 14(4), 750–772. <https://doi.org/10.1002/WMH3.534>
- Pambudi, A. A. (2021). Analysis of Indonesia's Decision Regarding WHO FCTC During President Joko Widodo's Administration, 2014–2019. *Journal of International Relations Studies*, 4(1).
- Permana, D. E. W., & Sanusi, S. (2021). Law Enforcement Against Illegal Cigarette Sales. *Responsive Law Journal*, 12(1). <https://doi.org/10.33603/responsif.v12i1.5026>
- Raihan Budiman, M., Dziki Zainal Arifin, M., & Fatulloh, Y. (2024). Decentralization Between the Central Government and Malang Regency Government in Efforts to Eradicate Untaxed Cigarettes. *UNES Review*, 6 (4). <https://doi.org/10.31933/unesrev.v6i4>
- Ravie, A. (2023). Indonesia's Dilemma in Ratifying the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) and Its Impact on the National Tobacco Industry. *Reformasi Forum Review*, 13(1), 48–63. <https://doi.org/10.33366/rfr.v%vi%i.3983>
- Rianto, W. H., Suliswanto, M. S. W., Sulistyono, S. W., Rusdianasari, F., & Anindynta, F. A. (2025). Maximizing Government Revenue: The Search for the Optimal Cigarette

- Excise Rate in Indonesia. *Journal of Revenue and Pricing Management*, 24(4), 393–400. <https://doi.org/10.1057/S41272-025-00520-1>
- Rosdianti, Y. (2021). Protection of the Right to Health Through Tobacco Control Policies. *Journal of Human Rights*, 8(8), 95–131. <https://doi.org/10.58823/jham.v8i8.72>
- Sonatha Sinaga, D., Aripin, S., Wijaya, A., & Public Administration, M. (2025). Collaborative Governance in Efforts to Eradicate Illegal Cigarettes in Bali Province. *PaKMAs: Journal of Community Service*, 5 (1), 181–190. <https://doi.org/10.54259/PAKMAS.V5I1.3813>
- Stone, E. (2017). MS 09.01 Global Tobacco Control. *Journal of Thoracic Oncology*, 12(11), S1689–S1690. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtho.2017.09.231>
- Subagyo, A., & Primawanti, H. (2022). Indonesia's National Interest in Rejecting the Ratification of the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC). *Global Political Studies Journal*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.34010/gpsjournal.v6i2>
- Sulastri, S., Herman, D., & Darwin, E. (2018). Intention to Quit Smoking Among Student Smokers Based on the Global Youth Tobacco Survey in State Vocational High Schools of Padang City. *Andalas Health Journal*, 7 (2), 205. <https://doi.org/10.25077/jka.v7.i2.p205-211.2018>
- Suryadinata, R. V. (2023). Study of the Risk of Pulmonary Function Disorders Among Adolescent Smokers. *Indonesian Journal of Professional Nursing*, 4 (1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.30587/ijpn.v4i1.5489>
- Yunarman, S., Munandar, A., Ahsan, A., Akbarjono, A., & Kusuma, D. (2021). Opportunities and Challenges of Tobacco Control Policy at the District Level in Indonesia: A Qualitative Analysis. *Asian Pacific Journal of Cancer Prevention*, 22(10), 3055–3060. <https://doi.org/10.31557/APJCP.2021.22.10.3055>